### Light Baryon Resonances: Restrictions and Perspectives

*Igor Strakovsky* The George Washington University

Dedicated to Yakov Isaakovich Azimov [May 22, 1938, SPb – December 6, 2016, SPb]







Volume 32B, number 6

PHYSICS LETTERS



ON THE POSSIBLE EXISTENCE OF A NEW NUCLEON STATE

Ya. I. AZIMOV A.F. Ioffe Physical-Technical Institute, Leningrad, USSR









## Where $\mathcal{D}id \mathcal{N}'$ from

- If we believe in SU(3), then every resonance must have ``family" (Unitarity Partners).
- Given underpopulation of conventional **3q** states, it is difficult to identify unconventional states.
- Baryon spectroscopy continues to motivate extensive experimental program, with most studies focused on missing resonance problem.
- If, however, N' state was to be found with mass between N & ∆, it would undoubtedly have *exotic* structure.



 In case of SU(6) x O(3), 434 states would be present if all revealed multiplets were fleshed out (three 70 & four 56).

• LQCD results are similar.

R. Koniuk & N. Isgur, Phys Rev Lett 44, 845 (1980)



Such baryon state (called here N', for brevity and according to tradition, though its isospin could be 1/2) was suggested to complete unitary multiplet of hyperon resonance states Ξ(1620) & Σ(1480), considered now to have 1\* status according to PDG.

• Gell-Mann anticipated existence of *multiquark states* including *pentaquarks* based on CQM.



M. Gell-Mann, Phys Lett 8, 214 (1964)





Anyone can ask Big Questions, but it is not easy to ask questions that would suggest new pathways leading to real progress of our understanding. Courtesy of Gerard 't Hooft, 2022

### What Else?







1/19/2023



### Was Progress Delayed by Prejudice ?

M. Aguilar-Benitez et al, Phys Lett B 170, 289 (1986)

 The evidence for strangeness +1 baryon resonances was reviewed in our 1976 edition [1], and more recently by Kelly [2] and by Oades [3]. Two new partial-wave analyses [4] have appeared since our 1984 edition. Both claim that the P<sub>13</sub> and perhaps other waves resonate.

 However, the results permit no definite conclusion – the same story heard for 15 years. The standards of proof must simply be much more severe here than in a channel in which many resonances are already known to exist. The general prejudice against baryons not made of three quarks and the lack of any experimental activity in this area make it likely that it will be another 15 years before the issue is decided.

References:

Particle Data Group (T.G. Trippe *et al.*) Rev Mod Phys **48**, No 2, Part II (1976)
R.L. Kelly, in *Proceedings of the Meeting on Exotic Resonances* (Hiroshima, 1978) edited by I. Endo *et al.* G.C. Oades, in *Low and Intermediate Energy Kaon-Nucleon Physics* (1981) edited by E. Ferrari and G. Violini
K. Hashimoto, Phys Rev C **29**, 1377 (1984); R.A. Arndt and L.D. Roper, Phys Rev D **31**, 2230 (1985)





Unitarity Partners (?)

Ya. Azimov, R. Arndt, IS, R. Workman, Phys Rev C 68, 045204 (2003)



### 8 – S wave Multiplet





G G















1/19/2023

Joint Seminar HEPD-THD, January 2023

### Igor Strakovsky 8

### What is Known about $\Xi(1620)$





 $\Xi(1620)$  via  $K^-p \rightarrow \Xi^-\pi^+K^0$  from  $\bigcirc$ 

 $\Xi(1620)$  via  $\Xi^+Cu \rightarrow \Xi^-\pi^+X$  from CEROT-WCR99

**Ξ**(1530) CERN-WA89 x 10<sup>3</sup> x 10<sup>3</sup> Hydrogen 110 40 K'p - H'r'K\* M(E'+') Kp→Ξ<sup>-</sup>π<sup>+</sup> K<sup>°</sup> (890) Ξ(1530) 748 Events 100 35 14 176 EVENTS **E(1530)** 90. 30 13 30 60 EVENTS/(25 MeV/c<sup>2</sup>) EVENTS/10 MeVIc<sup>2</sup> combinations/(7 MeV/c<sup>2</sup>) 25 12 Ξ**(1690** 70 Ξ(1620)? 60-20 11 Ξ(1620) 31 events 600 50 C) 15 400 40 Ξ(1606) 10 200 30 10-20 5 F -200 10 04 1.5 1.6 1.7 18 1.65 1.7 1.75 19 20 15 16 1.7 16 77 18 1.4 1.8 1.9 15 2.0  $M(\Xi^{+}\pi^{+})$  (GeV/c<sup>2</sup>)  $(GeV/c^2)$  $M(=\pi^{+}) GeV/c^{2}$ E"" MASS M.I. Adamovich et al, Eur Phys J C 5, 621 (1998)  $M = 1605.5 \pm 5.6 MeV$ = 1624±3 MeV 20.8±7.4 MeV 22.5 MeV '= **Г** = E. Briefel et al, Phys Rev D 16, 2706 (1977)

R.T. Ross et al, Phys Lett 38B, 177 (1972)

1/19/2023















M. Sumihama et al, Phys Rev Lett **122**, 072501 (**2019**)





Invariant mass spectrum in sideband region.

 $M = 1610.4 \pm 6.0 \text{ (stat)}_{-4.2}^{+6.1} \text{(syst) MeV}$  $\Gamma = 59.9 \pm 4.8 \text{ (stat)}_{-7.1}^{+2.8} \text{(syst) MeV}$ 





Bump Hunting





## Possible Nature of $\Xi(1620)$

 If 10 is predicted to be 1/2<sup>+</sup> (P-wave) Where is ground (S-wave) state (1/2<sup>-</sup>)?

 If this state is analogue to 10, then its intrinsic structure must be different, & its flavor structure must be different as well could be 8.

 There is no prediction of 1/2- in ChSA (no predictions for negative parity @ all).





•  $\Xi(1620)$  resonance can be explained as K  $\Lambda$  molecular state with  $I(J^P) = 1/2(1/2^-)$ .















### Σ(1480) MASS (PRODUCTION EXPERIMENTS)

VALUE (MeV)	EVTS	DOCUMENT ID		TECN	COMMENT	_
≈ 1480 OUR EST	IMATE					-
$1480 \pm 15$	$365 \pm 60$	ZYCHOR	06	SPEC	$pp \rightarrow pK^+(\pi^{\pm}X^{\mp})$	
1480	120	ENGELEN	80	HBC	$K^- \rho \rightarrow (\rho \overline{K}^0) \pi^-$	
$1485 \pm 10$		CLINE	73	MPWA	$K^- d \rightarrow (\Lambda \pi^-) p$	
$1479 \pm 10$		PAN	70	HBC	$\pi^+ p \rightarrow (\Lambda \pi^+) K^+$	60
$1465 \pm 15$		PAN	70	HBC	$\pi^+ p \rightarrow (\Sigma \pi) K^+$	DE

#### Σ(1480) WIDTH (PRODUCTION EXPERIMENTS)

_
-)
-

## What is Known about $\Sigma(1480)$

•  $\Sigma(1480)$ , if exists, looks to be good partner of  $\Xi(1620)$ .

• We want to reiterate our standing requests:

• Please continue to inform us of mistakes and omissions.



• We reemphasize that it is inappropriate to make reference to this [PDG] compilation instead of to the original work; we provide the references, please use them. A.H. Rosenfeld *et al*, Rev Mod Phys **40**, 77 (**1968**)









 $M = 1475 \pm 15 \text{ MeV } \Gamma = 30 \pm 15 \text{ MeV}$ 





 $\Sigma(1480)$  via  $e^+p \rightarrow e' \mathcal{K}^0 p X$  from



 $\Sigma(1480)$  via  $pC^{12} \rightarrow \Lambda \pi X @ 10 \ GeV/c$  from



1/19/2023

Joint Seminar HEPD-THD, January 2023









Joint Seminar HEPD-THD, January 2023



1/19/2023



Joint Seminar HEPD-THD, January 2023











### What is Known about $\Lambda(1330)$

 Λ(1330), if exists, looks to be good partner of Ξ(1620) & Σ(1480).













G. Bozoki *et al,* Phys Lett **28B**, 360 (**1968**) N.P. Bogachev et al, JETP Lett 10, 105 (1969)







## N (1100)







# Completeness of Unitary Multiplet $N(1100)?(?^{?})$





¥.

### $\mathcal{N}'$ below Pion Threshold via $pp \rightarrow nX^{++}$ from $\bigotimes \mathsf{TRIUMF}$

<mark>S. Ram *et al,* Phys Rev D **49**, 3120 (**1994**)</mark>

Bump Jum. • Direct experimental searches for N' have begun rather recently.



• No baryon was detected with I = 3/2,  $m_N < m_X < m_N + m_{\pi}$ ,

& production cross section > **10**<sup>-7</sup> of backward elastic **np** cross section.







• Two of these could decay only radiatively, while for **3rd** (slightly above  $\pi N$  thr) radiative decay channel could also be important.



B. Tatischeff et al, Phys Rev Lett 79, 601 (1997) B. Tatischeff et al, Eur Phys J A 17, 245 (2003

1/19/2023

 $pp \rightarrow \pi^+ p X^0$ ,  $\mathcal{M}_X > 960 \text{ MeV from}$ 

 $pd \rightarrow ppX$  from



 This study renewed interest, both theoretical & experimental, in subject,

- If correct, such baryons would have I=1/2, masses of 1004, 1044, & 1094 MeV, & widths less than 4–15 MeV.
- Existence of these states was opposed in

A.I. L'vov & R.L. Workman. Phys Rev Lett 81, 1346 (1998)

on basis of their non-observation in **Compton** scattering on nucleons loosely bound in deuterons.



L. Fil'kov et al, Eur Phys J A 12, 369 (2001)













1/19/2023



### $\pi^{-}p \rightarrow n'\gamma \rightarrow n\gamma\gamma @ rest from TRIUMF$





1/19/2023

### Narrow Resonances in [Modified] PWA from



R. Arndt, Ya. Azimov, M. Polyakov, IS, & R. Workman, Phys Rev C 69, 035208 (2004

- Conventional PWA (by construction) tends to miss narrow Res with  $\Gamma$  < 20 MeV.
- We assume existence of narrower Resonance, add it to amplitude, then refit over whole DB.



- <u>True Resonance</u> should provide effect only in single PW.
- While <u>non-Resonance</u> source may show similar effects in various **PWs**.















.







Joint Seminar HEPD-THD, January 2023

### **S**<sub>11</sub>: M = 1145 MeV, Γ = 50 keV [ $T_{\pi}$ = 79.5 MeV]

- We find *no evidence* for elastic  $\pi N$ resonances in region between  $\pi N$  thr & 1300 MeV having width  $\Gamma > 50$  keV.
- Present  $\pi N$  data *cannot exclude* even purely elastic (or inelastic) narrow resonances with  $\Gamma < 50$  keV.
- Insertion of trial narrow resonances may be good "technical trick" to check quality of PWA fit to set of experimental data.











Ievgen Lavrukhin, PhD Thesis, GW, 2020



1/19/2023



### On Low-Lying 1/2<sup>-</sup> Octet Baryon

C. Chen, W.Q. Niu, & H.Q. Zheng, Chi P C 46, 081001 (2022)



• N/D study of  $S_{II}$  channel  $\pi N$  amplitude

$$\sqrt{s} = 0.89 - 0.24i$$
 GeV – Situation is unstable

Q.Z. Li, Y. Ma, W.Q. Niu, Y.F. Wang, & H.Q. Zheng, arXiv:2102.00977 [nucl-th]

• Existence of  $N^*(890)$  is further verified.





### Boundaries for $\mathcal{N}'$ below/above $\pi \mathcal{N}$ Threshold

Ya. Azimov, R. Arndt, IS, R. Workman, Phys Rev C 68, 045204 (2003)



$$\begin{split} W (\pi^{-} p \to n\gamma) \\ & \Gamma_{N' \to N\gamma} < 5 \ eV \qquad Br_{\gamma}^{2} \ \Gamma_{p'} < 10 \ eV \\ & \frac{Y(ep \to e'\pi^{+}X^{0})}{Y(ep \to e'\pi^{+}n)} < 10^{-4} \qquad \left[\frac{Br_{\gamma} \ \Gamma_{p'}}{Br_{\gamma} \ \Gamma_{\Delta}} < 3 \ 10^{-3}\right] \\ & \frac{Y(ed \to e'pX^{0})}{Y(ed \to e'pn)} < 10^{-4} \end{split}$$





Jefferson Lab







### Spectroscopy of Baryons

- Light unusual resonances have no place in 3q sector.
- 5q sector could accept them.
- Detailed study is required because question of exotics is still active.

"...either these states will be found by experimentalists or our confined, quark-gluon theory of hadrons is yet lacking in some fundamental, dynamical ingredient which will forbid the existence of these states or elevate them too much higher masses."



 Production of multiquark hadrons may be new kind of hard processes; it is related with higher *Fock* components.

IMMAR



- Hit hard to see what is it there inside Make two hadrons hit each other hard:
- $e^+e^-$  annihilation into hadrons:  $e^+e^- \rightarrow q$ -bar- $q \rightarrow$  hadrons.
- Deep Inelastic lepton-hadron Scattering (*DIS*):  $e^-p \rightarrow e^-X$ .
- Hadron-hadron collisions.
- *Hadrons/photons* with large transverse momenta wrt to collision axis.

This hypothesis may suggest new experiments.













1/19/2023

experiment



igor@gwu.edu Igor Strakovsky 37

No.







Y.I. Azimov, I.I. Strakovsky, W.J. Briscoe, and R.L. Workman,					
Legendre analysis of differential distributions in hadronic					
reactions,					
Phys. Rev. C <b>95</b> , 025205 (2017) CI=3					
P. Adlarson et al. [A2 Collaboration at MAMI],					
Measurement of $\pi^0$ photoproduction on the proton at MAMI C,					
Phys. Rev. C <b>92</b> , 024617 (2015) CI= <b>49</b>					
I.I. Strakovsky, S. Prakhov, Y.I. Azimov et al. [A2 Collaboration],					
Photoproduction of the $\omega$ meson on the proton near threshold,					
Phys. Rev. C <b>91</b> , 045207 (2015) CI=35					
M. Dugger et al. [CLAS Collaboration],					
Beam asymmetry $\Sigma$ for $\pi^+$ and $\pi^0$ photoproduction on the proton					
for photon energies from 1.102 to 1.862 GeV,					
Phys. Rev. C 88, 065203 (2013) CI=47					
Y. Azimov and I. Strakovsky,					
Exotics and PWA for $\pi N$ scattering,					
PoS Hadron2013, 034 (2013) CI=0					
I.I. Strakovsky et al. [Crystal Ball at MAMI Collaboration],					
Measurement of the $\gamma p \rightarrow \eta p$ reaction with the Crystal Ball					
detector at the Mainz Microtron (MAMI-C),					
AIP Conf. Proc. <b>1374</b> , 439 (2011) CI=0					
M.J. Amaryan, G. Gavalian, C. Nepali, M.V. Polyakov, Y. Azimov,					
W.J. Briscoe, G.E. Dodge, C.E. Hyde, F. Klein, V. Kuznetsov,					
I. Strakovsky, and J. Zhang					
Observation of a narrow structure in $p(\gamma, K_s)X$ via interference					
with $\phi$ -meson production,					
Phys. Rev. C 85, 035209 (2012) CI=30					
I.I. Strakovsky, Y. Qiang, Y.I. Azimov, W.J. Briscoe, H. Gao, D.W.					
Higinbotham, and V.V. Nelyubin,					
Properties of the resonance $\Lambda(1520)$ as seen in the forward					
electroproduction at JLab Hall A,					
AIP Conf. Proc. <b>1374</b> , 181 (2011) CI=0					
E.F. McNicoll et al. [Crystal Ball at MAMI Collaboration],					
Study of the $\gamma p \rightarrow \eta p$ reaction with the Crystal Ball detector at					
the Mainz Microtron(MAMI-C),					
Phys. Rev. C 82, 035208 (2010)					
[erratum: Phys. Rev. C 84, 029901 (2011)] CI=153					

### My Papers with Yakov Azimov

Y. Qiang, <b>Y.I. Azimov</b> , I.I. Strakovsky, W.J. Briscoe,	H. Gao,				
D.W. Higinbotham, and V.V. Nelyubin,					
Properties of the $\Lambda(1520)$ resonance from high-pre	ecision				
electroproduction data,					
Phys. Lett. B <b>694</b> , 123 (2011)	CI=16				
<b>Y.I. Azimov</b> , K. Goeke, and I. Strakovsky,					
How is exotics produced? Where to search for it?					
eConf <b>C070910</b> , 206 (2007)	CI=0				
<b>Y.I. Azimov</b> , K. Goeke, and I. Strakovsky,					
An explanation why the $\varTheta^{\scriptscriptstyle +}$ is seen in some experin	ients and				
not in others,					
Phys. Rev. D 76, 074013 (2007)	CI=17				
Y.I. Azimov, K. Goeke, and I. Strakovsky,					
A possible explanation why the $\varTheta^{\!$					
and not in others,					
[arXiv:0704.3045 [hep-ph]]	CI=3				
Y. Qiang et al. [JLab Hall A Collaboration],					
A search for $\Sigma_{5}^{0}$ , $N_{5}^{0}$ , and $\Theta^{++}$ pentaquark states,					
Phys. Rev. C 75, 055208 (2007)	CI=10				
<b>Y.I. Azimov</b> , V. Kuznetsov, M.V. Polyakov, and I. Strakovsky,					
K*-couplings for the antidecuplet excitation,					
Phys. Rev. D 75, 054014 (2007)	CI=8				
I.I. Strakovsky, R.A. Arndt, Y.J. Azimov, M.V. Polvakov, and					
R.L. Workman,					
Review of experimental aspects of pentaquark phys	vics,				
AIP Conf. Proc. <b>775</b> , 41 (2005)	CI=3				
<b>Y.I. Azimov</b> , R.A. Arndt, I.I. Strakovsky, R.L. Workman, and					
K. Goeke,					
Search for higher flavor multiplets in partial wave analyses.					
Eur. Phys. J. A <b>26</b> , 79 (2005)	CI=17				
Y.I. Azimov, V. Kuznetsov, M.V. Polyakov, and I. St	rakovsky,				
Extraction of radiative decay width for the non-strange partner					
of $\Theta^{\scriptscriptstyle +}$ ,	- *				
Eur. Phys. J. A 25, 325 (2005)	<b>CI=50</b>				
-					



1/19/2023



I.I. Strakovsky, R.A. Arndt, Y.I. Azimov, M.V. Poly	akov, and			
R.L. Workman,				
Present status of the nonstrange and other flavor partners of the				
exotic $\Theta^{+}$ baryon,				
J. Phys. Conf. Ser. 9, 218 (2005)	CI=4			
I. Strakovsky, R. Arndt, R. Workman, Y.I. Azimov, and M.				
Polyakov,				
$\Theta(1540)^+$ and associated exotic states,				
Acta Phys. Polon. B 36, 2247 (2005)	CI=2			
Y.I. Azimov and I.I. Strakovsky,				
Resonances, and mechanisms of Theta-production,				
Phys. Rev. C 70, 035210 (2004)	CI=20			
R.A. Arndt, Y.I. Azimov, M.V. Polyakov, I.I. Strakovsky, and				
R.L. Workman,				
Nonstrange and other unitarity partners of the e	xotic $\Theta^{\scriptscriptstyle+}$ baryon,			
Phys. Rev. C 69, 035208 (2004)	<b>CI=148</b>			
Y.I. Azimov, R.A. Arndt, I.I. Strakovsky, and R.L. Workman,				
Light baryon resonances: Restrictions and perspectives,				
Phys. Rev. C 68, 045204 (2003)	CI=35			
<b>Y.I. Azimov</b> and I.I. Strakovsky,				
On dibaryon states,				
Yad. Fiz. <b>51</b> , 606 (1990)				
[Sov. J. Nucl. Phys. 51, 384 (1990)]	CI=2			
<b>Y.I. Azimov</b> and I.I. Strakovsky,				
Symmetry of weak interaction and anti-quarks in	the hadronic			
ground state,				



